

September 26, 2025

Division of Criminal Justice Services

80 South Swan Street, Room 118 Albany, NY 12210

Video Conference Locations:

505 South State Street, 4th Floor Syracuse, NY 13202

666 Old Country Road, Suite 700 Garden City, NY 11530

40 Washington Square South, Suite 420 New York, NY 10012

445 Hamilton Avenue, Suite 1203 White Plains, NY 10601

08:36 AM - 12:54 PM

DRAFT MEETING MINUTES

Commission Members in Attendance:

Lt. Col. Nicholas Banbury
Pasquale Buffolino, Ph.D.
James Chithalen, Ph.D.^{1,2}
Lydia de Castro
Steven Epstein, Esq.
William Fitzpatrick, Esq.²
Jessica Goldthwaite, Esq.
Michael Marciano, Ph.D.
Erin Murphy, Esq.
Beverly Rauch
Rossana Rosado
Michelli Schmitz
Ann Willey, Ph.D.

¹ Representative of Commission Member James V. McDonald, M.D.

² Member joined the meeting during Executive Session.

DCJS Staff in Attendance:

Taylor Aaron
Dean DeFruscio
Colleen Glavin, Esq.
Katherine Mayberry
Shelley Palmer
Joseph Popcun
Brianna Robinson
Lindsey Rockwell
Matthew Schrantz, Esq.
Elizabeth Suparmanto

Other Attendees:

Michelle Adams – New York State Police Crime Laboratory
Jennifer Alois – NYS DCJS Latent Print Laboratory
Jill Dooley – New York State Police Crime Laboratory
James Harrison – Westchester County Department of Public Safety Crime Laboratory
Rebecca Hartman – Monroe County Office of the Medical Examiner Division of Forensic Toxicology
Nichole Hurbanek – New York State Police Crime Laboratory
Michael Jankowiak – New York State Police Crime Laboratory
Thomas Leach – New York State Police Crime Laboratory
Andrea Lester – NYS DCJS Latent Print Laboratory
Paul Stasaitis – Westchester County Department of Public Safety Crime Laboratory
Christian Westring – Niagara County Sheriff's Office Forensic Laboratory

Chair Rosado opened the meeting by stating that she was attending virtually, and OFS Director Palmer would run the meeting. Ms. Palmer proceeded to take a roll call as members were in attendance in Albany and virtually. A quorum was established with 11 voting members (Banbury, Buffolino, de Castro, Epstein, Goldthwaite, Marciano, Murphy, Rauch, Rosado, Schmitz, and Willey)³.

00:01:36 –

00:02:06

Approximate video times

00:00:00 -

00:01:35

Ms. Palmer then requested a motion to approve the September 26, 2025, agenda. The motion to approve the agenda was made by Ms. Rauch, seconded by Dr. Buffolino, and approved with 11 votes (Banbury, Buffolino, de Castro, Epstein, Goldthwaite, Marciano, Murphy, Rauch, Rosado, Schmitz, and Willey).

00:02:07 – 00:02:43

Ms. Palmer requested a motion to approve the minutes of the June 13, 2025, Commission meeting. The motion to approve the minutes was made by Mr. Epstein, seconded by Ms. Schmitz. The motion was approved with 10 votes (Banbury, Buffolino, de Castro, Epstein, Goldthwaite, Marciano, Murphy, Rauch, Rosado, and Schmitz) and 1 abstention (Willey).

Ms. Palmer then requested a motion to enter into Executive Session to discuss matters relating to a current investigation or matters that may lead to the appointment,

00:02:44 – 00:03:34

80 South Swan Street, Albany, New York 12210 | www.criminaljustice.ny.gov

³ See FN 2.

promotion, demotion, discipline, or suspension of a particular person. The motion was made by Dr. Buffolino and seconded by Dr. Marciano. The motion was approved with 10 votes (Banbury, Buffolino, de Castro, Epstein, Marciano, Murphy, Rauch, Rosado, Schmitz, and Willey) and 1 opposed (Goldthwaite). The Commission adjourned into Executive Session at 8:40 am. Mr. Fitzpatrick joined the meeting during Executive Session at 8:41 am and Dr. Chithalen joined at 9:18 am.

Approximate video times

Executive Session concluded at 9:58 am and the Commission reconvened the open meeting at 10:08 am, after a brief break. Ms. Palmer stated that after a thorough discussion during Executive Session and a comprehensive investigation regarding the anonymous complaints to the New York City Office of Chief Medical Examiner [Department] of Forensic Biology, which included delays in response to requests for information, the Commission and its working group will be sending a letter to the OCME regarding the importance of effective management to support technical services of public forensic laboratories, including but not limited to outside employment policies and practices. For awareness, this letter will also be sent to all public forensic laboratories in New York State.

00:03:58 – 00:04:53

Next, the Commission reviewed the Accreditation/Laboratory Updates. Matters regarding the following laboratories were considered: Monroe County Crime Laboratory, New York City OCME Department of Forensic Toxicology, New York City OCME Forensic Anthropology Unit, New York City Police Department Police Laboratory, New York City Police Department Latent Print Section, Suffolk County Crime Laboratory, Westchester County Department of Laboratories & Research Division of Forensic Science, Westchester County Department of Laboratories & Research Division of Forensic Toxicology, and Westchester County Department of Public Safety Crime Laboratory. Representatives from the laboratories were available in person or via Zoom to respond to members' questions.

00:04:54 – 00:13:40

The next agenda item was Old Business. Ms. Palmer gave a verbal update on the Familial Search Policy. The Commission then discussed updates from the DNA Subcommittee including their responses to the DNA Mixture Interpretation: A NIST Scientific Foundation Review report and the NIST Forensic DNA Interpretation and Human Factors: Improving Practice Through a Systems Approach report. An invitation will be sent to DNA Subcommittee members to attend the next Commission meeting and further discuss their review of the NIST reports.

00:13:42 – 00:50:39

Following this discussion, Dr. Marciano proposed a potential plan for NYS public forensic laboratories to begin adopting standards on the OSAC registry. After a lengthy discussion, the Commission decided they required additional information and tasked OFS with extending an invitation to stakeholders including technical experts, members of NYCLAC, and OSAC representatives to further discuss the adoption of the OSAC registry at the next meeting of the Commission.

00:50:40 - 01:26:35

Additionally, a status update was provided regarding the DNA Subcommittee's review of recent Qiagen disclosures. The Commission then discussed a memo regarding disclosures of dishonesty or gross misconduct that was disseminated to all appropriate parties following a motion at the June 13, 2025, Commission meeting.

01:26:40 - 01:30:32

Approximate video times

01:30:33 – 02:49:16

The Commission then reviewed disclosures from Erie County Medical Examiner's Office Forensic Toxicology Laboratory, Monroe County Crime Laboratory, Monroe County Office of the Medical Examiner Division of Forensic Toxicology, Nassau County Office of the Medical Examiner Division of Forensic Toxicology, New York City OCME Department of Forensic Biology, New York City OCME Department of Forensic Toxicology, New York City Police Department Latent Print Section, NYS DCJS Latent Print Laboratory, Onondaga County Center for Forensic Sciences, Suffolk County Crime Laboratory, Suffolk County Medical Examiner Toxicology Laboratory, Westchester County Department of Laboratories & Research Division of Forensic Science, Westchester County Department of Laboratories & Research Division of Forensic Toxicology, and Yonkers Police Department Forensic Science Laboratory. Representatives from the laboratories were available in person or via Zoom to respond to members' questions. Chair Rosado left the meeting at 11:47 am.

Ms. Palmer then stated that the next meeting of the Commission will take place on December 12, 2025, with the location to be determined. A motion to adjourn was made by Dr. Buffolino, seconded by Ms. Rauch, and approved unanimously.

02:49:17 – 02:50:13

Note: Video of the meeting is available at https://www.youtube.com/user/nyspublicsafety