



February 7, 2020

**Empire State Development Corporation (ESDC)
633 3rd Avenue
37th Floor
New York, NY
9:01 AM – 11:47 AM**

DRAFT MEETING MINUTES

DNA Subcommittee Members in Attendance:

Frederick Bieber, Ph.D.
Allison Eastman, Ph.D.
Katherine Gettings, Ph.D.
Kenneth Kidd, Ph.D.
Jenifer Smith, Ph.D.
Amanda Sozer, Ph.D.
Bruce Weir, Ph.D.

DCJS Staff in Attendance:

Jill Dooley
Michael Flaherty
Natasha Harvin-Locklear
Janine Kava
Shelley Palmer
Jackalynne Vimislik

Other Attendees:

Neha Desai - NYC OCME Department of Forensic Biology
Mark Desire - NYC OCME Department of Forensic Biology
Karen Dooling - Nassau County Division of Forensic Services
Matthew Fontanez – New York County District Attorney’s Office
Jessica Goldthwaite – The Legal Aid Society
Susan Horan – Kings County District Attorney’s Office
Chris Kamnik – New York County District Attorney’s Office
Maksudul Khan – NYS ITS
Kyra McKay - NYC OCME Department of Forensic Biology
Melissa Mourges - New York County District Attorney’s Office
Meredith Rosenberg – NYC OCME Department of Forensic Biology
Diane Shkoditch – Suffolk County Crime Laboratory
Raymond Valerio – Bronx District Attorney’s Office
Helen Wong – Suffolk County Crime Laboratory

OFS Director Dr. Jill Dooley opened the meeting with an introduction of new members, Dr. Bruce Weir as Chair, and Dr. Jenifer Smith. Dr. Dooley also introduced Ms. Natasha Harvin-Locklear, who has replaced Mr. Brett Knowles, as special counsel for both the DNA Subcommittee and the Commission on Forensic Science.

*Approximate
video times*

00:00:00 –
00:01:06

Dr. Weir addressed the Subcommittee and noted that all members are present including Drs. Bieber, Eastman, Gettings, Kidd, Smith, and Sozer. He then asked for a motion to approve the agenda which was made by Dr. Gettings, seconded by Dr. Eastman and approved unanimously.

00:01:06 –
00:02:28

The Chair then asked Subcommittee members for questions or comments on the minutes from the November 8, 2019 Subcommittee meeting. Dr. Kidd made a motion to accept the minutes with an amendment of an additional statement of appreciation for the work of previous Chairman Dr. Dwight Adams. Dr. Sozer seconded this motion and approved with six votes for, zero against, and one abstention [Dr. Smith].

00:02:28 –
00:03:55

The Subcommittee reviewed updates from the Erie County Central Police Services Forensic Laboratory, Monroe County Crime Laboratory, Nassau County Division of Forensic Services, New York City OCME Department of Forensic Biology, Onondaga County Center for Forensic Sciences Laboratory, Suffolk County Crime Laboratory, and Westchester County Division of Forensic Sciences.

00:03:55 –
00:47:10

During this portion of the meeting, Dr. Eastman made a motion to issue guidance that whether, or not, there were any findings in Appendix A, there must be a statement present under the findings section. The motion was seconded by Dr. Kidd and approved unanimously. Upon further discussion, Dr. Kidd made an additional motion to send letters to Laboratory Directors and Quality Assurance Managers regarding internal FBI Quality Assurance Standards (QAS) audits and additional letters to ANAB and the FBI SWGDAM Chair regarding external FBI QAS audits. It was determined that when there are no findings, the internal auditors must not leave Appendix A blank. Further, external auditors should state whether, or not, there were any findings in Appendix A under the findings section. This motion was seconded by Dr. Sozer and approved unanimously. Additionally, Subcommittee members request that the QAS be filled out in its entirety as per the instructions.

00:05:00 –
00:19:29

The Subcommittee reviewed documents related to the renewal of accreditation of the New York City OCME Department of Forensic Biology. The Chair requested a motion to issue a binding recommendation to the Commission on Forensic Science to renew the New York State accreditation in the discipline of Biology for the period concurrent with their ANAB accreditation. Dr. Smith made the motion, it was seconded by Dr. Eastman, and approved unanimously.

00:25:30 –
00:28:35

The Chair then moved to Old Business. A verbal update was provided on the partial match program, familial search program, and CODIS Bulletins.

00:47:10 –
01:12:15

Under New Business, Subcommittee members reviewed the Annual Laboratory Summaries from each of the labs. Additionally, under New Business, Subcommittee members discussed the review of Partial Match and Familial Search policies.

01:12:15 –
01:35:19:

The Subcommittee then moved on to laboratory disclosures from the Onondaga County Center for Forensic Services and the Suffolk County Crime Laboratory.

01:35:19 –
01:56:38

The Chair called for a motion to enter executive session to discuss Familial Search and the potential impact on public safety. Dr. Kidd made the motion, Dr. Bieber seconded, and it was approved unanimously.

01:56:38 –
01:58:00

The Chair stated that no action was taken in executive session. Dr. Bieber made a motion to invite Dr. Anne Walsh of the New York State Department of Health and Mr. Ted Hunt of the United States Department of Justice to discuss the topic of Genetic Genealogy. Dr. Kidd seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously.

01:58:00 –
01:59:11

The Chair stated that the next meeting of the Subcommittee will be May 1, 2020. A motion to adjourn was made by Dr. Gettings, seconded by Dr. Eastman, and approved unanimously.

01:59:11 –
01:59:52

Note: Video of the meeting is available at <https://www.youtube.com/user/nyspublicsafety>